



The use of mediation in the settlement of aerospace disputes

Sabela Gayo

Fakultas Hukum, Universitas Bhayangkara Jakarta Raya, Jakarta, Indonesia

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received May 26, 2023

Revised Jun 3, 2023

Accepted Jun 25, 2023

Keywords:

Aerospace

Delay

Dispute Resolution

ABSTRACT

Flight delays are an aspect of aerospace where it often happens and the public as passengers experience losses and passengers have the right to compensation and compensation for the incident. The purpose of this study was to determine the arrangements regarding the delay in scheduled departures and assess the responsibility of the airline to passengers regarding the delay in scheduled departures. The research conducted is normative juridical research is a study that deductively begins the analysis of the articles in the legislation governing the problem. Juridical legal research is research that refers to literature studies, while normative is legal research that aims to determine the relationship between one regulation and another and its application in practice. Arrangements regarding flight delays or flight cancellations are regulated in Article 147 of law no. 1 of 2009 and further regulated in Articles 10 and 11 of Minister of Transportation regulation NO. 77, 2011. The airline is obliged to compensate and compensate passengers in the form of transferring to another flight without paying any fees, and provide compensation in the form of material compensation to passengers in the form of money in accordance with the amount of losses suffered by passengers.

This is an open access article under the [CC BY-NC](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/) license.



Corresponding Author:

Sabela Gayo,
Fakultas Hukum Universitas Bhayangkara Jakarta Raya,
Jl. Perjuangan No.81,RT.003/RT.002,Marga Mulya, Kota Bekasi
Email: sabelagayo369@gmail.com

1. INTRODUCTION

PT. Dirgantara Indonesia is the first and only aircraft industry in Indonesia and in Southeast Asia. PT. Dirgantara Indonesia not only produces various aircraft but also helicopters, weapons, providing training and Maintenance services for aircraft engines. Dirgantara Indonesia is also a sub-contractor for major aircraft industries in the world such as Boeing, Airbus, General Dynamic, Fokker and so on (Rasji & Sinaga, n.d.). One of the efforts in meeting the needs of life and human livelihood itself is the utilization of Science and technology in the field of air transport activities. Throughout the world of aerospace travel, the issue of air transport can not be separated from the issue of state sovereignty in the air space that allows a sovereign state to grant or deny permission for a flight operation to or from through its airspace (Dirwan, n.d.)

Entering the middle of the 20th Century, exactly one year before World War II ended, an international meeting was held to discuss the future of Civil Aviation. The meeting was a continuation of previous meetings that also talked about the world of Aerospace in general, namely the 1919 Convention held in Paris, France and the 1929 Havana Convention in Cuba. The convention was facilitated by the United States in Chicago, United States from November 1, 1947 to December 7, 1947. Invitations to attend the convention spread to 53 countries in the world, in addition there are two special invitations addressed to the Ministers of Thailand and Denmark based in Washington D.C.

In the content of the invitation, the United States government proposed to make temporary regulations on aviation, as well as seek the existence of a principle of the International Air law system to be included as an international treaty for the creation of World Peace. One of the great powers, the Soviet Union, chose not to attend the international meeting. According To H.K. Martono, foreign aircraft operating in the territory of the country is not desired by the Soviet Union, considering the main interests of the Soviet Union is still prioritizing national security and welfare. During the convention, four proposals were proposed for discussion by the delegates. First, Australia and New Zealand proposed internationalization of all civil aviation, including adjustments to the unification of airlines and regulations governed by a single international authority. The second Proposal came from the UK, containing the establishment of an international aviation authority with regulatory, economic, as well as technical authority. Then the United States, emphasizing freedom of the Air (freedom of the Air), where every company has the right to land between countries. And finally, Canada's proposal calls for an international aviation authority with authority in economic regulation, as well as the existence of councils in each regional region, and regulation of international air services (Bagasi et al., 2016)

Over the past few years, the aerospace industry in ASEAN has experienced significant growth, making it one of the fastest growing regional economies globally. Data from the World Bank, one of the regions that has the fastest economic growth rate in the world is Southeast Asia. ASEAN recorded an increase in GDP growth of 11.6% CAGR in the last decade, and GDP growth is projected to reach US\$ 4 trillion by 2020. Behind the significance of the passion of the aviation industry in Southeast Asia, tucked airline companies that carry the concept of Low Cost Carrier (LCC) business has mushroomed in ASEAN countries in the past two decades. In simple terms, a low-cost airline or LCC is an airline that offers flights by eliminating some Full-service flight services. Characteristics of the differences between LCC airlines with traditional airlines(Kamello et al., 2017)

In the case of aerospace problems, there are cases where airlines cannot carry out their obligations as business actors to passengers. Like for example delays from flight schedules, running out of seats even though passengers have have a ticket up to bad service during the flight such as damaged luggage and other so on. There are several lists recorded by the Indonesian consumer Foundation there are several airlines that companies often get the most complaints by passengers. Flights referred to the fifth airline, among others, Lion Air, Mandala Air, Air Asia, Sriwijaya Air, and Garuda Indonesia (Ayuningtyas et al., 2023)

The responsibility that can be given by the airline to passengers is to replace loss or so-called compensation. Paid must be compensated by the airline on the grounds that if slow to come or slow to arrive at the destination, only not about flight delays, but also about security and safety passengers and passenger luggage(Pandansari & Audrey, 2023). Passengers who feel aggrieved by the air carrier company have the right to claim his rights as a passenger for events that occur in within the scope of liability airlines that have been set in Aviation Law No. 1 of 2009 articles 146 and 147 determined that if there is a delay in flight schedules, then the air carrier Company shall responsible for any loss of such delay. Legal remedy if consumers are harmed due to flight delays is to file a claim for compensation or claim to the airline (Plaza et al., 2022)

From the picture above it is clear that there is still much to be excavated from the organization of this Air Transport, how exactly the responsibility is regulated by air transport companies and regulated in law No.1 year 2009 on the fly. Based on the things stated in the background above, which becomes the problem in this study is how Alternative Dispute Resolution kerdirgantara in the event of aircraft delays?

2. RESEARCH METHOD

This study employs normative legal methodologies. This study utilizes both primary and secondary legal resources. Through the study of literature, the technique for gathering legal materials is carried out. Normative research methods in which research begins with *das solen* (law on paper) and ends with *das sein* (law in actions). This research is classified as *ke* in normative legal research based on a literature review or a review of merely secondary sources. It is said to be normative because the law is assumed to be an autonomous entity whose enforceability is determined by the law itself

and not by external factors. This research methodology employs the Statute and Conceptual approaches. Primer Legal Material, which is authoritative legal material, has authority in the form of laws and regulations relevant to this paper's discussion. (M. N. Sitompul & Sitompul, 2022)

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

A dispute is a condition in which there is a party who feels aggrieved by the other party, which in turn conveys this dissatisfaction to the second party. When there is a difference of opinion, it is called a dispute. In the context of law, especially contract law, disputes are meant. In the context of law, especially contract law, what is meant by a dispute is a dispute that occurs as outlined in a contract, either in part or in whole. In other words, there has been a *wanprestasi* by the parties or one of the parties (Satrya et al., 2020)

A dispute is a problem that occurs between one party and another party in the agreement due to an act of breaking a promise or interpretation (Darwis et al., 2019). The same is also conveyed by Takdir Rahmadi, which means that conflicts or disputes are situations and conditions in which people experience disputes that are of a nature or disputes that exist only in their perception (Irene & Simanjuntak, 1946)

In resolving disputes, which is done through the court is called litigation. Where litigation is an attempt to resolve various legal cases through the court (Sinaga, 2017). So both parties to the dispute must take part in the trial, which is attended by the prosecutor, judge, minutes, as well as the Registrar. A judge has the power and authority to decide what happens. Because the procedure in court has a formal nature and has a technique to decide a case by producing an appropriate agreement and both parties mutually accept the decision that has been determined by the judge (Jungai & Hongjun, 2012)

Mediation comes from English, "mediation", or mediation, which is the settlement of disputes involving third parties as mediators or dispute resolution by mediating. Christopher W. Moore argued that mediation is intervention in a dispute by a third party that is acceptable to the disputing party, is not part of both parties and is neutral. These third parties do not have the authority to make decisions. He is in charge of helping the warring parties to voluntarily come to an agreement accepted by each party in a dispute (Gayo & Sitompul, 2022). According to the formulation of Article 6 paragraph (3) of Law No. 30 of 1999 also says that "by written agreement of the parties" disputes or disagreements are resolved through the assistance of "one or more expert advisors" or through mediators" (A. Sitompul, 2023)

Thus, in principle, mediation is a way of resolving disputes outside the court through negotiations involving third parties who are neutral (non-intervention) and impartial (impartial) and accepted by the parties to the dispute (Maryana, 2023). The third party is called a mediator or mediator whose job is to help the parties to the dispute in solving their problems, but does not have the authority to make decisions (Aziz et al., 2022). With mediation, it is expected to reach a common point in resolving the problems faced by the parties, which will then be set forth as a collective agreement. Decision - making is not in the hands of the mediator (Brief, 2022) but in the hands of the parties to the dispute. With regard to the place of mediation, the parties can determine for themselves and choose where they want to hold this mediation. Mediation can be held anywhere in the world (Fibrianto et al., 2022)

Indemnity required by the airline to the passenger previously regulated in Article 36 of the Minister of Transportation Regulation Number 25 year 2008 on the implementation of Air Transport is: a. Delay of more than 30 (thirty) minutes up to 90 (ninety) minutes, scheduled commercial air transport companies are required to provide drinks and food lightweight; b. Delay of more than 90 (ninety) minutes, commercial air transport company the scheduler is obliged to provide drinks, snacks, lunch or dinner and transfer the passenger to the next flight or to the air transport company other scheduled commerce, when requested by passengers; c. Delay of more than 180 (one hundred and eighty) minutes, air freight companies scheduled merchants are obliged to provide drinks, snacks, lunch or dinner if the passenger cannot be transferred to the next flight or to other scheduled commercial air transport companies, then to the passenger must be provided with accommodation facilities to be transported on day flights next (Ryerson et al., 2014)

Regarding the responsibility of the airline or air freight carrier regulated in Article 147 paragraph (1) of Law No. 1 of 2009, but further regulated in the regulation of the Minister of Communications No. 77 Of 2011 On Responsibility Air Freight Carrier. Responsibility of the carrier according to law No. 1 In 2009, the carrier is required to submit a passenger air ticket as one a means of proof of agreement between the passenger and the carrier, but nevertheless tickets are not the only means of proof of agreement because it can still be proven by other evidence such as receipts for the purchase of passenger air tickets (M. N. Sitompul & Sitompul, 2022). Under the agreement the carrier is entitled to receive payment for transportation passengers from the airport of departure to the destination airport, otherwise passengers must pay the cost of transportation and entitled to enjoy transportation services from the airport departure until the destination airport safely, because it is in the passenger *halam* not safely arrive at the destination airport, therefore the carrier is responsible for losses suffered by passengers or users of air transport services (Apriani & Sari, 2012)

Legal Remedies Pursued By Aircraft Passengers Through Dispute Resolution Consumers outside the court negotiation, Consumer Dispute Resolution (BPSK) and Consumer Protection Non-Governmental Organizations (LPKSM) Legal remedies that can be done by both parties, passengers and parties Airlines for not getting to court usually use attempts Non-litigation law or legal remedies outside the court to obtain results that can called winwin solution (H, 2022). Law No. 30 of 1999 on arbitration and Alternative Dispute Resolution by way of arbitration including mediation, negotiation, and Conciliation. Negotiation as one of the right ways to solve the problem of loss due to delays in flight schedules because this method has advantages over through the court or litigation because the negotiation method does not require a fee or evidence to prove as used in litigation. Negotiation is an effort to resolve disputes between the parties without going through the judicial process in court with the aim to reach a mutual agreement on the basis of cooperation more harmonious and more creative (Ariman Sitompul, Pagar Hasibuan, 2021)

In principle, the negotiation process involving two or more people, namely the parties who need each other's involvement to achieve a common result, the parties concerned consider the negotiation process is the best way to resolve the dispute therefore the parties must have hope for an outcome an end acceptable to both parties to the dispute. BPSK is a non-structural institution that has a function as an institution resolve consumer issues out of court cheaply, quickly, and simple. This Badaan is needed in regions and cities throughout Indonesia. Members- its members consist of representatives of government officials, consumers, and business actors (Dharmasisya et al., 2022). Aircraft passengers as consumers who have problems with products/services consumption will be able to obtain their rights more easily and efficiently through the role of BP (Dahwir, A. 2022). In addition, the Consumer Dispute Resolution agency can be an access to obtain information and guarantee equal legal protection for both aircraft passengers as consumers and the airline as business actors. In handling and managing consumer problems, BPSK has authority to conduct an examination of the veracity of reports and information from the the disputing parties (Hukum & Islam, 2015)

Dispute resolution process through LPKSM according to the Protection Act Consumers can be selected by way of mediation, conciliation, and arbitration (Dan et al., 1997). In the process the parties to the dispute or problem in this case the passenger aircraft with the airline agreed to choose the way of settlement. Process results settlement set forth in the form of agreement (agreement) in writing, which must be adhered to by both parties to the dispute and the role of LPKSM only as mediators, conciliators, and arbitrators (Agung & Indonesia, 2017)

However, the legal remedy for aircraft passengers through Consumer Dispute Resolution in court is contained in Article 48 of Law Number 8 of 1999 concerning consumer protection dispute resolution through the court refers to the provisions of the General Court applicable subject to the provisions of Article 45 of the Protection Act Consumers. Aircraft passengers as consumers who want to sue against the airline through the court, the passenger concerned must comply with the provisions and procedures litigants in court.

4. CONCLUSION

Aerospace disputes against service providers to consumers of aviation services if there is a unilateral flight cancellation has been regulated very clearly in Law No. 1 of 2009 on Aviation, which regulates compensation and compensation in the form of a full refund of ticket payment (refund) and also in Article 10 and 11 Permenhub No. 77 of 2011, namely transferring to another flight without paying additional fees, and / or providing consumption, accommodation, and transportation costs if there are no other flights to the destination. Efforts that can be done by passengers who are harmed by the occurrence airline flight delays used either through efforts law through the courts commonly referred to as litigation or legal remedies outside courts are commonly referred to as non-litigation. Mediation with the concept of negotiation is one form of settlement of non-litigation legal remedies that are used and are considered the easiest, fastest and do not require proof of who is guilty or who is harmed because of the principles of out-of-court or non-litigation settlement is a "win-win solution" or not there are winners and there are no losers.

REFERENCES

- Agung, M., & Indonesia, R. (2017). *Penegakan Hukum Terhadap Zona Larangan Terbang*. 2(2), 123–134.
- Apriani, D., & Sari, A. (2012). *Pandecta Pemanfaatan Wilayah Geostationer Orbit dan Satelit (Kajian Terhadap Kedaulatan Negara Indonesia)*. 7.
- Ariman Sitompul, Pagar Hasibuan, M. S. (2021). The Morality Of Law Enforcement Agencies (Police, Prosecutor's Office, KPK) In Money Laundering With The Origin Of The Corruption. *EUROPEAN SCIENCE REVIEW*, 9(19), 58.
- Ayuningtyas, C. D., Hukum, F., & Airlangga, U. (2023). *Kecelakaan*. 5(3), 1057–1075.
- Aziz, M. A., Agung, F. B., Gontor, U. D., & Gontor, U. D. (2022). *The Effectiveness Of Sharia Economic Dispute Resolution Between Religious Court And National Sharia Arbitration Board*. 5(2), 216–245.
- Bagasi, B., Penumpang, T., Penerbangan, P., & Fauzi, H. (2016). *No Title*. 4(2), 142–152.
- Brief, L. (2022). *The Use Of Mediation As An Alternative Dispute Resolution In Oil And Gas Dispute*. 11(5), 2818–2826. <https://doi.org/10.35335/legal>
- Dan, H. K., Sulisrudatin, N., & Ip, S. (1997). Hukum kepailitan dan permasalahannya di indonesia. *Jurnal Ilmiah Hukum Dirgantara*, 7(1), 158–160. file:///C:/Users/ACER/Downloads/129-251-1-SM.pdf
- Darwis, N., Cara, T., Sederhana, G., Sederhana, G., & Pendahuluan, A. (2019). Upaya keadilan bagi rakyat melalui small claim court. *Jurnal Ilmiah Hukum Dirgantara*, 10(1), 28–30. <https://journal.universitassuryadarma.ac.id/index.php/jihd/article/viewFile/401/371>
- Dharmasisya, V., Fakultas, J., & Fadhiil, M. D. (2022). " Dharmasisya " *Jurnal Program Magister Hukum Fhui Pelaksanaan Air Defence Identification Zone (Adiz) Sebagai Upaya Penegakan Hukum Wilayah Udara Negara*. 2(December).
- Dirwan, A. (n.d.). *Analisis Masalah Pengaturan Ruang Udara Di Atas Laut Kepulauan Indonesia (ALKI)*.
- Fibrianto, E., Hidayat, T., Darmawan, W. B., & Djuyandi, Y. (2022). *Dalam Mewujudkan Pengamanan Wilayah Perbatasan Negara (Studi Kasus di Laut Natuna Utara) dapat terwujud sesuai dengan apa yang diharapkan TNI sendiri . Interoperabilitas pemantauan adalah wilayah dimana Utara Terkait ketegasan Negara atas wilayah Laut Natuna maka TNI yang Utara*. 1(2), 119–128. <https://doi.org/10.24198/aliansi.v1i2.39582>
- Gayo, S., & Sitompul, A. (2022). *香港社會科學學報 The Use of Mediation as an Alternative Health Dispute Resolution*. 59.
- H, H. A. S. (2022). *Pengembangan Pembangunan Industri Perkapalan Nasional Dalam Mendukung Keamanan Pertahanan Indonesia Untuk Menjaga Kedaulatan Perairan Di Wilayah Indonesia Hendro Antoni.S.H*. 10(April), 92–102.
- Hukum, F., & Islam, U. (2015). *Pelanggaran Ruang Udara oleh Pesawat Asing Menurut Hukum Internasional dan Hukum Nasional Indonesia*. 22(4), 538–565.
- Irene, R., & Simanjuntak, L. (1946). *Regina Irene Laurence Simanjuntak_072111233005_THI C_Paper THI*. 2013, 1–7.
- Jungai, T., & Hongjun, X. (2012). *Optimizing Arrival Flight Delay Scheduling Based on Simulated Annealing Algorithm*. 33, 348–353. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.phpro.2012.05.073>
- Kamello, T., Purba, H., & Sembiring, R. (2017). 75 - 87. 5(3), 75–87.
- Maryana, R. (2023). *Penyelesaian Sengketa Pajak Antara PT. Samsung Electronics Indonesia dengan Direktur Jenderal Pajak*. *Petium Journal*, 11(April), 33–41. file:///C:/Users/ACER/Downloads/1335-Article Text-4633-1-10-20230619.pdf
- Pandansari, R., & Audrey, P. (2023). *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding Formulation of Alternative Medical Dispute Resolution Models in Telemedicine Services in Hospitals*.

- 532-541.
- Plaza, M. P., Kolek, F., Leier-wirtz, V., Brunner, J. O., Traidl-hoffmann, C., & Damialis, A. (2022). *Detecting Airborne Pollen Using an Automatic , Real-Time Monitoring System : Evidence from Two Sites*.
- Rasji, H., & Sinaga, N. A. (n.d.). *No Title*.
- Ryerson, M. S., Woodburn, A., Ryerson, F. M. S., Ryerson, M. S., & Woodburn, A. (2014). c. 4363. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01944363.2014.961949>
- Satrya, K., Taira, N., Hukum, J., Winata, H., Kerugian, T., Akibat, P., Bagasi, H., Yang, T., Barang, M., & Adigama, J. H. (2020). *Ganti rugi., Princess Anggun Octafiany, Fakultas Hukum 2020*. 2(2), 1-23.
- Sinaga, N. A. (2017). Peranan Asas Keseimbangan Dalam. *Jurnal Ilmiah Hukum Dirgantara*, 8(1), 34-40. <file:///C:/Users/ACER/Downloads/137-267-1-SM.pdf>
- Sitompul, A. (2023). *Alternative Dispute Resolution Criminal Acts Of Money Politics In Elections In View Of Normative Law*. 2(1), 1-9.
- Sitompul, M. N., & Sitompul, A. (2022). *Legal Politics Legalization Convention In Perspective International Law*. 11(5), 3467-3473. <https://doi.org/10.35335/legal>
- Agung, M., & Indonesia, R. (2017). *Penegakan Hukum Terhadap Zona Larangan Terbang*. 2(2), 123-134.
- Apriani, D., & Sari, A. (2012). *Pandecta Pemanfaatan Wilayah Geostationer Orbit dan Satelit (Kajian Terhadap Kedaulatan Negara Indonesia)*. 7.
- Ariman Sitompul, Pagar Hasibuan, M. S. (2021). The Morality Of Law Enforcement Agencies (Police, Prosecutor's Office, KPK) In Money Laundering With The Origin Of The Corruption. *EUROPEAN SCIENCE REVIEW*, 9(19), 58.
- Ayuningtyas, C. D., Hukum, F., & Airlangga, U. (2023). *Kecelakaan*. 5(3), 1057-1075.
- Aziz, M. A., Agung, F. B., Gontor, U. D., & Gontor, U. D. (2022). *The Effectiveness Of Sharia Economic Dispute Resolution Between Religious Court And National Sharia Arbitration Board*. 5(2), 216-245.
- Bagasi, B., Penumpang T., Penerbangan, P., & Fauzi, H. (2016). *No Title*. 4(2), 142-152.
- Brief, L. (2022). *The Use Of Mediation As An Alternative Dispute Resolution In Oil And Gas Dispute*. 11(5), 2818-2826. <https://doi.org/10.35335/legal>
- Dan, H. K., Sulisrudatin, N., & Ip, S. (1997). Hukum kepailitan dan permasalahannya di indonesia. *Jurnal Ilmiah Hukum Dirgantara*, 7(1), 158-160. <file:///C:/Users/ACER/Downloads/129-251-1-SM.pdf>
- Darwis, N., Cara, T., Sederhana, G., Sederhana, G., & Pendahuluan, A. (2019). Upaya keadilan bagi rakyat melalui small claim court. *Jurnal Imiah Hukum Dirgantara*, 10(1), 28-30. <https://journal.universitassuryadarma.ac.id/index.php/jihd/article/viewFile/401/371>
- Dharmasisya, V., Fakultas, J., & Fadhiil, M. D. (2022). " Dharmasisya " *Jurnal Program Magister Hukum Fhui Pelaksanaan Air Defence Identification Zone (Adiz) Sebagai Upaya Penegakan Hukum Wilayah Udara Negara*. 2(December).
- Dirwan, A. (n.d.). *Analisis Masalah Pengaturan Ruang Udara Di Atas Alur Laut Kepulauan Indonesia (ALKI)*.
- Fibrianto, E., Hidayat, T., Darmawan, W. B., & Djuyandi, Y. (2022). *Dalam Mewujudkan Pengamanan Wilayah Perbatasan Negara (Studi Kasus di Laut Natuna Utara) dapat terwujud sesuai dengan apa yang diharapkan TNI sendiri . Interoperabilitas pemantauan adalah wilayah dimana Utara Terkait ketegasan Negara atas wilayah Laut Natuna maka TNI yang Utara*. 1(2), 119-128. <https://doi.org/10.24198/aliansi.v1i2.39582>
- Gayo, S., & Sitompul, A. (2022). *香港社會科學學報 The Use of Mediation as an Alternative Health Dispute Resolution*. 59.
- H, H. A. S. (2022). *Pengembangan Pembangunan Industri Perkapalan Nasional Dalam Mendukung Keamanan Pertahanan Indonesia Untuk Menjaga Kedaulatan Perairan Di Wilayah Indonesia Hendro Antoni.S.H*. 10(April), 92-102.
- Hukum, F., & Islam, U. (2015). *Pelanggaran Ruang Udara oleh Pesawat Asing Menurut Hukum Internasional dan Hukum Nasional Indonesia*. 22(4), 538-565.
- Irene, R., & Simanjuntak, L. (1946). *Regina Irene Laurence Simanjuntak_072111233005_THI C_Paper THI*. 2013, 1-7.
- Jungai, T., & Hongjun, X. (2012). *Optimizing Arrival Flight Delay Scheduling Based on Simulated Annealing Algorithm*. 33, 348-353. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.phpro.2012.05.073>
- Kamello, T., Purba, H., & Sembiring, R. (2017). 75 - 87. 5(3), 75-87.
- Maryana, R. (2023). Penyelesaian Sengketa Pajak Antara PT. Samsung Electronics Indonesia dengan Direktur Jenderal Pajak. *Petitum Journal*, 11(April), 33-41. <file:///C:/Users/ACER/Downloads/1335-Article Text-4633-1-10-20230619.pdf>
- Pandansari, R., & Audrey, P. (2023). *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding Formulation of Alternative Medical Dispute Resolution Models in Telemedicine Services in Hospitals*. 532-541.
- Plaza, M. P., Kolek, F., Leier-wirtz, V., Brunner, J. O., Traidl-hoffmann, C., & Damialis, A. (2022). *Detecting Airborne Pollen Using an Automatic , Real-Time Monitoring System : Evidence from Two Sites*.

- Rasji, H., & Sinaga, N. A. (n.d.). *No Title*.
- Ryerson, M. S., Woodburn, A., Ryerson, F. M. S., Ryerson, M. S., & Woodburn, A. (2014). c. 4363. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01944363.2014.961949>
- Satrya, K., Taira, N., Hukum, J., Winata, H., Kerugian, T., Akibat, P., Bagasi, H., Yang, T., Barang, M., & Adigama, J. H. (2020). *Ganti rugi... Princess Anggun Octafiany*, *Fakultas Hukum 2020*. 2(2), 1–23.
- Sinaga, N. A. (2017). PERANAN ASAS KESEIMBANGAN DALAM. *Jurnal Ilmiah Hukum Dirgantara*, 8(1), 34–40. <file:///C:/Users/ACER/Downloads/137-267-1-SM.pdf>
- Sitompul, A. (2023). *Alternative Dispute Resolution Criminal Acts Of Money Politics In Elections In View Of Normative Law*. 2(1), 1–9.
- Sitompul, M. N., & Sitompul, A. (2022). *Legal Politics Legalization Convention In Perspective International Law*. 11(5), 3467–3473. <https://doi.org/10.35335/legal>